

Submission No.			27	
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter			Brendan Heneghan (88 Parkmore Drive)	
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response
Ref: Metro planning application no 314724, 25 November 2022				
1	Letter	1	<p>A lot of people get off at Charlemont no doubt headed for the metro. They are holding up the tram bound for Bray crossing the railway line to get to the stairs. And there's people coming up the stairs slowing them down. Someone has got the wheels of his case stuck in the track.</p> <p>The lady announces a slight delay. I'm told that there's persistent problems with turning the Luas that finish at Charlemont and because all the passengers have to get out, they are stopped longer at the station too. However we move off a minute later.</p>	<p>The Luas stations are designed as a shared space between pedestrians and trams, hence the designated pedestrian crossing between the Charlemont Stop Luas platforms. The interaction between pedestrians and trams will be managed the same as for any other Luas stop.</p> <p>The stairs referred to have been sized to accommodate the combined predicted passenger flows for Luas to Metro, and Metro to Luas. The lift is provided, again sized for the predicted passenger flows, for persons of restricted mobility and so that people are not having to carry luggage of a size that should not be carried on the stairs.</p> <p>Details of the proposed changes at the Charlemont Luas for MetroLink are described in EIAR Chapter 4, Description of the MetroLink Project, section 4.17.12.2, with proposed layouts for access and egress set out on sheets 54 and 55 of the Railway Order: Structure Drawings, Structures Details Book 2 of 3 MetroLink Stations Dublin City Council.</p>
2	Letter	2	<p>On our previous holiday to Lanzarote, we made the mistake of getting off the Luas at Charlemont and transferring to the metro at that point. The metro had just opened. We had massive problems getting the cases down the stairs. Some guy coming up the stairs barged into the missus, even though the signs all say keep to the left. I ended up having to go back up to fetch her case. Not great to have to leave it there as it was a bit of an obstruction. There was a big queue for the lift. I can't get why they didn't put in escalators. Any why didn't they have the metro directly under the Luas with a bank of lifts and escalators. We have to find another way to get to the airport for the pre-Christmas trip.</p> <p>And the return was even worse. Lugging the cases full of the souvenirs for the grandkids up seven flights. That stairs is a nightmare. And when we reached the platform everyone was blocking the platform at the top of the stairs. Took all the benefit out of the holiday. It's like that awful transfer at 168th St Manhattan when you get off the A train from JFK and want to get the 1 to the Bronx.</p>	<p>As noted by response (1) above, the stairs should not be used by passengers carrying luggage of a size not suitable for stairs, and the stairs and lift have been sized for predicted passenger flows, as indicated in Chapter 6 (MetroLink Operations and Maintenance, section 6.4.1), with a lift capacity of 10 passengers.</p> <p>Chapter 6 (MetroLink Operations and Maintenance) indicates that the operation strategy of the proposed Project is driven by the forecasted passenger demand. As such, the peak passenger demand profiles for each station have informed the layout and sizing of platforms and stations to ensure safe and comfortable movements of all users. In recognition of the higher footfall anticipated at this station, two stations entrances are proposed. Additionally, three escalators will be provided at the northern entrance between the station and concourse levels, reflecting the higher footfall predicted with the connection to the Luas line. As presented in Appendix A9.2-B Traffic and Transport Assessment- Charlemont Station, pedestrian modelling of the station indicates that the design has sufficient capacity to accommodate the pedestrian demand generated at the Charlemont MetroLink station.</p> <p>Within the constraints of the site it is not possible to fit escalators in linking ground level to the Luas, and nor would it be feasible to economically place a station beneath the existing Luas that met the MetroLink operational requirements and architectural vision for the Project. It is also highly likely the demolition of buildings would be required around the Luas if such an option was developed and it would not be possible to provide the quality of station entrances that has been achieved for the proposed Charlemont Station.</p>
3	Letter	2	<p>It was our plan to get off the metro at O'Connell. There's a good chance that there will be a Luas directly across the street which is going to turn around and head south via Parnell. And sure it's a short walk over to Parnell. Again you'd have thought they would have had an underground passage to the Parnell stop from O'Connell metro.</p>	<p>The investment in designing, constructing and maintaining subsurface connection to the surface that is already provided by lifts and escalators from O'Connell Street Station is not justified or feasible.</p>
4	Letter	2	<p>On the way out they got on the Orbital bus on the South Circular Road and got off at Harcourt Terrace. So far so good. At the canal end of Harcourt Terrace, you'd have thought there should be a bridge or a tunnel, as the metro entrance is directly over the canal. However they didn't bother with one. Instead you have to use the Charlemont station as a sort of bridge.</p> <p>Before they got to the bridge poor Fred nearly got moved down by some cyclist who thought he was in the Tour de France. Why would they have the station entrance blocked by a busy cycle track?</p> <p>They then had to lug the cases up the stairs on the Harcourt Terrace side and down on the Charlemont metro side. It's an awfully narrow platform for a busy station. There were lots of people waiting on the platform for the Sandyford tram, so they had to wheel the cases onto the track to get past them. Fortunately it was quite a nice day, if a bit cold.</p>	<p>The northern Charlemont Station entrance is located just off Grand Parade which is accessible via bridges from the east and west ends of Grand Parade via the R138 and Charlemont Street respectively.</p> <p>The interaction of the Luas Green Line stop entrance with the cycle track is not part of the MetroLink Project, and the MetroLink Charlemont Station has not been designed to be accessed via the Luas Green Line Station entrance on the Harcourt Terrace side, although this route can be used if one so chooses to. The primary access to/from the north and south entrances of Charlemont MetroLink Station is from Grand Parade and Dartmouth Road respectively.</p>

Submission No.			27	
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter			Brendan Heneghan (88 Parkmore Drive)	
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response
Ref: Metro planning application no 314724, 25 November 2022				
5	Letter	3	I had figured out myself that the best route back to Kilmacud for myself and the missus was to get off the metro at Stephen's Green. True we had to walk across the north side of the Green but we managed it in four minutes. I recollect some claim that seems far fetched , back in the day that it took seven minutes. There's a good wide pavement, no street to cross and it's all on the flat so we can wheel the cases. No lugging them up stairs.	TII's role is to deliver the MetroLink project as provided for in the previous Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2016-2035) and the current Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2022-2042) and as supported by the Dublin City Development Plan 2022 - 2028. The Charlemont terminus and the connection from St Stephens Green to Charlemont / Ranelagh is provided for by the previous Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2016-2035) and the current Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2022-2042) and further the location of the interchange is supported by the Dublin City Development Plan 2022 - 2028. Accordingly, as previously noted, a lift is provided to/from the Luas Green Line for persons with luggage or of restricted mobility. However the option remains for people to interchange with the Luas Green Line at whichever location they prefer.
6	Letter	3	I do wonder why it never occurred to anyone to move the Luas station at the Green to the bit of track between Grafton and Dawson Street. Indeed would it not have occurred to them to use the siding past Dawson Street to turn some trams? That's a very short hop from the metro.  I vaguely remember the fuss about a very long walk between metro and Luas at the Green. However we're used to the walk from the Green Line to the Red Line at O'Connell/Abbey on our way to Heuston and it takes about the same time. The problem there is the busy road crossing where you have to wait two goes of the pedestrian lights unless you are very quick on the feet. However if that connection is grand, why isn't the Green one?	TII's role is to deliver the MetroLink project as provided for in policy and this application is in relation to the Railway Order for the Metrolink project only. The feasibility of moving the Luas stop is not part of this application since the Luas is an existing system with services continuing further south from St Stephen's Green that would not be serviced by a spur to St Stephen's Green East. The intent of the Project is to supplement and complement existing infrastructure investment wherever possible. Turning trams to a spur and then turning them back would reduce the level of service / increase headways provided by the Green Line.  Please refer to response (5) above regards the interchange at St Stephen's Green.

Submission No.			27	
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter			Brendan Heneghan (88 Parkmore Drive)	
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response
Ref: Metro planning application no 314724, 25 November 2022				
7	Letter	3	I wish someone had brought all this up before they started building the metro. Charlemont is an awful connection between metro and Luas and there are better ways. There would not have been a chunk of change out of a billion in the cost of the last bit of the metro line - the poor taxpayer.	<p>TII have given careful consideration to where MetroLink should best integrate with the Luas Green Line.</p> <p>The Board is required to have regard to the likely consequences for proper planning and sustainable development in the area in which it is proposed to carry out railway works (section 43(1) of the 2001 Act) and as such the following matters are relevant.</p> <p>The connection from St Stephens Green to Charlemont / Ranelagh is supported by the current Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2022-2042). The Transport Strategies were prepared by the National Transport Authority, scrutinised by the Joint Oireachtas Committee on Transport and approved by the Minister for Transport. It notes in section 12.3.2, "Charlemont offers the optimal location for the primary interchange with the Green Line in response to growing demand in the longer term and is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the south west, south or south east of the city region should sufficient demand arise."</p> <p>The Transport Strategy is "a consideration material to the proper planning and sustainable development of the area or areas in question." Development Plans are required to be consistent with the Transport Strategy. The Dublin City Development Plan 2022-2028 envisages this station at Charlemont in policy SMT22 "To support the expeditious delivery of key sustainable transport projects so as to provide an integrated public transport network with efficient interchange between transport modes, serving the existing and future needs of the city and region and to support the integration of existing public transport infrastructure with other transport modes. In particular the following projects subject to environmental requirements and appropriate planning consents being obtained: ... MetroLink from Charlemont to Swords".</p> <p>Accordingly, the location of the Charlemont station was a strategic decision made at the highest levels of transport and land use planning and such is fully consistent with the proper planning and sustainable development of the area.</p> <p>The proposed MetroLink alignment has not been extended south of Charlemont for the reasons set out by the GDA strategy, section 12.3.10, "The challenges associated with the upgrading of the Luas Green Line to a metro standard of service have led to the emergence of an alternative proposal which seeks to meet travel demand from south of Sandyford along a new light rail corridor which serves UCD post-2042.</p> <p>For this reason it has been necessary to determine the most appropriate interchange and termination location for MetroLink. As noted by the GDA Transport Strategy 2022-2042, section 12.3.2, "Charlemont offers the optimal location for the primary interchange with the Green Line in response to growing demand in the longer term and is an appropriate location to facilitate any potential future metro extensions to serve the south west, south or south east of the city region should sufficient demand arise.' This is also reflected by EIAR Chapter 7, section 7.7.8 MetroLink Southern Terminus Location that explains the rationale for selecting Charlemont as the optimum location for interchange with the Green Line.</p>
8	Letter	5	Note 1 the public transport section of Grater Dublin Area Transport Plan 2022-2042 proposes two Luas lines respectively ex Tallaght and Sandyford converging at Charlemont.	TII's role is to deliver the MetroLink project as provided for in the previous Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2016-2035) and the current Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2022-2042) and as supported by the Dublin City Development Plan 2022 - 2028. As such, the extension of the Luas falls outside the remit of this application.
9	Letter	5	Note 2 Feasibility Study Luas Lucan August 2021 page 11 (ancillary to the above) proposes an Option 3 ending at Charlemont (which they call Grand Canal Mall there)	<p>The Luas Lucan is to be developed as per NTA's development strategy.</p> <p>TII's role is to deliver the MetroLink project as provided for in the previous Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2016-2035) and the current Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2022-2042) and as supported by the Dublin City Development Plan 2022 - 2028. As such, the extension of the Luas falls outside the remit of this application.</p>

Submission No.			27	
Organisation Name or Name of Submitter			Brendan Heneghan (88 Parkmore Drive)	
Item No.	Section Ref.	Page No.	Observation Statement	TII Response
Ref: Metro planning application no 314724, 25 November 2022				
10	Letter	5	Note 3 Dublin City Council Area Committee wanted to discuss the Charlemont terminal with National Transport Authority and passed an emergency resolution asking them to come in. In rejecting that request on 23 May 2022, the Deputy Chief Executive so described the Charlemont experience.	The Charlemont terminus and the connection from St Stephens Green to Charlemont / Ranelagh is provided for by the previous Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2016-2035) and the current Transport Strategy for Greater Dublin Area (2022-2042) and further the location of the interchange is supported by the Dublin City Development Plan 2022 - 2028.